

AGENDA
HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

City of High Point
Municipal Office Building
City Council Chambers
April 8, 2021
6:00 p.m.

1. Call To Order
2. Approval Of Minutes
 - 2.I. December 3, 2020 Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting
3. Hearing Items
 - 3.I. Matt Mahoney For Lily Pad Investors, LLC; 319 & 321 Montlieu Avenue; CA-21-04
A request to add a new gravel driveway from Brookside Drive to tie into existing parking area located in the rear yard.

Documents:

[STAFF REPORT \(CA-21-04\).PDF](#)
 - 3.II. Pat Cardillo For PDA Enterprise 2011 Trust, 909 Johnson Street, CA-21-05
A request to add a deck on roof of one-story extension on the rear of house.

Documents:

[STAFF REPORT \(CA-21-05\).PDF](#)
4. New Business
 - 4.I. Petition For Washington Street Area
 - 4.II. Major And Minor Works COA Fees
 - 4.III. The Architecture Of High Point Books
5. Announcements
 - 5.I. Minor Works Certificate Of Appropriateness Report
6. Adjournment

**CITY OF HIGH POINT
PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT**

**STAFF REPORT
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CA-21-04
April 8, 2021**

Request	
Applicant: Matt Mahoney for Lily Pad Investors, LLC 319 & 321 Montlieu Avenue	Owner(s): Lily Pad Investors, LLC
Proposal: A request to add a new gravel driveway from Brookside Drive to tie into existing parking area located in the rear yard.	

Description of Property
Built in 1926, the Hoskins-Flagler House is a 2-1/2 story frame Tudor Revival style house with a front-gabled wing, 6-over-6 window sash and a front entrance located in a steeply pitched shed next to the front wing. Vinyl siding covers the house over the original wood clapboard siding. The home was built for Alice Hoskins, a schoolteacher who was the widow of Baskin Hoskins, president of the Staley Manufacturing Company. The home was sold to F.J. Flagler and his wife Lucy in 1927. F.J. Flagler was general freight agent for the High Point, Thomasville and Denton Railroad. (Information from <i>Sherrod Park Local Designation Report</i> by Longleaf Historic Resources, Ruth Little and Todd Johnson, 1990).

Details of Proposal

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to construct a new gravel driveway from Brookside Drive to an existing concrete parking area located in the rear yard of the residence located at 321 Montlieu Avenue. Currently, a concrete driveway located on the eastern side of the residence that is shared with 323 Montlieu Avenue is used to access the concrete parking area. At some point in the past, residents of 321 Montlieu Avenue started driving directly from the concrete parking in the rear yard through the grassed side yard to Brookside Drive. When High Point University started managing the property, they added stone to the dirt ruts that had developed in the side yard. The applicant's proposed driveway is to be located further north along Brookside Drive from the unauthorized driveway, approximately 25 feet from the rear property line where there is currently a considerable amount of bamboo growing. The driveway is proposed to be approximately 8 feet in width, paved with crusher run gravel and would not require the removal of any trees.

Staff Analysis and Comment

The Historic District Design Guidelines state that proposals for new driveways should consider the compatibility of the siting, spacing, configuration, width, and paving materials with the historic property and district. Additional driveways or parking areas for residential properties may be necessary to accommodate households with multiple vehicles, though newly paved areas should be limited so as not to significantly alter the site's ratio of paved area to green space.

When needed, new driveways and parking areas should be located as inconspicuously as possible, typically at the rear of the property and screened with vegetation, fences, or walls where possible in order to minimize the visual impact on the historic district or property. The Guidelines also state that while concrete is the most common paving material in the historic districts, consideration should be given to permeable or semi-permeable paving materials, such as brick pavers or crushed stone to reduce run-off. Maintaining existing trees is also important when siting new driveways and parking areas to help minimize the glare, heat and noise of paved surfaces.

The following design guidelines for *Walkways, Driveways, and Off-street Parking* are relevant to the applicant's request to construct an 8-foot wide gravel driveway from Brookside Drive to the existing concrete parking area located in the rear yard:

5. *Design new walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas to be compatible in location, patterns, spacing, configurations, dimensions, materials, and color with existing walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas that contribute to the overall historic character of the district.*
6. *Locate new walkways, driveways, and off-street parking areas so that the topography of the building site and significant site features, including mature trees, are retained.*
9. *Protect large trees and other significant site features from immediate damage during construction and from delayed damage due to construction activities, such as loss of root area or compaction of the soil by equipment. It is especially critical to avoid compaction of the soil within the critical root zone of trees.*

Prior to approval of any Certificate of Appropriateness request, the Commission must make a finding that the applicant's proposed work is congruent with the special character of the Sherrod Park Historic District and in compliance with the Historic District Design Guidelines. Issuance of a driveway permit from the City of High Point Transportation Department is required prior to installation of any new driveway.

Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of the requested Certificate of Appropriateness to install an 8-foot wide gravel driveway off Brookside Drive approximately 25 feet from the rear property line to the existing concrete parking area located in the rear yard, because the request is congruent with the Sherrod Park Historic District and the Historic District Design Guidelines based on the following:

- The proposed location for the new 8-foot wide gravel driveway is in a relatively inconspicuous location in the rear yard and is of minimal width;
- The proposed crusher run gravel driveway is more permeable than concrete or asphalt and has less visual impact than a new concrete or asphalt driveway; and
- The proposed location of the driveway does not require removal of any trees, including 3 persimmon trees located in the vicinity of the driveway that contribute to Sherrod Park's diverse tree canopy.

Report Preparation

This report was prepared by Planning and Development Department staff member David J. Fencil, AICP and reviewed by Christopher Andrews, AICP and G. Lee Burnette, AICP.

**CITY OF HIGH POINT
PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT**

**STAFF REPORT
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CA-21-05
April 8, 2021**

Request	
Applicant: Pat Cardillo for PDA Enterprise 2011 Trust 909 Johnson Street	Owner(s): PDA Enterprise 2011 Trust
Proposal: A request to add a deck on the roof of one-story wing on the rear of house.	

Description of Property
<p>Built in 1928, the J. Everett Marsh Jr. House is a 2-story, side-gabled, Colonial Revival-style house that is 5 bays wide and double-pile with a slate roof, modillion cornice, and variegated brick in a common bond pattern with scored mortar joints. The home has 6-over-6 wood sash windows with wide surrounds and quarter-round windows in the side gables, flanking the exterior end brick chimneys. The 6-panel entrance door has a 5-light transom and classical surround with fluted pilasters, tall entablature, and swan's neck broken pediment. There is a one-story, side-gabled wing on the south elevation with an inset, screened porch at the front. A one-story, hip-roofed screened porch on the north elevation is supported by round wood columns. There is a two-story, gabled-ell at the southwest rear corner of the house, and a one-story flat-roofed wing at the northwest corner. The earliest known occupant of the house is J. Everett Marsh Jr., who was the President of Marsh Furniture.</p> <p>The property also contains a one-story, side-gabled frame guesthouse constructed in 1928 that is two bays wide and single-pile with a recessed, side-gabled bay at the east corner. The guesthouse is covered with wood weatherboard siding and has 4-over-4 wood sash windows and a louvered storm door sheltered by an aluminum roof on metal posts, and an exterior brick chimney. (Information from <i>Uptown Suburbs Historic District National Register Nomination Report</i> by hmwPreservation, 2012).</p>

Details of Proposal

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to construct a deck on the roof of the one-story flat-roofed rear wing on the northwest corner of the residence. The deck measures 31 feet in length and is 12 feet wide for 21 feet where the deck is located behind the two-story portion of the residence and 15 feet wide for 10 feet where it wraps around the two-story portion of the residence. The deck is proposed to be constructed of pressure-treated wood with metal balusters. The deck is proposed to be constructed with two levels. Approximately one-quarter of the deck is located at the current roof level due to an existing 2nd floor exterior door while the rest of the deck appears to be approximately 16 to 18 inches above the flat roof. A new dark gray ribbed metal roof has been installed under the raised portion of the deck. This is considered an after-the fact COA request due to much of the work being completed prior to applying for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Staff Analysis and Comment

The Historic District Design Guidelines state that the design and construction of modern decks should be undertaken with careful attention to avoid compromising the architectural integrity of the historic structure and district. This is achieved by maintaining both the visual character of the district through appropriate deck siting and by preserving the historic material of the building by proper design and construction.

There is no specific guidance or mention of roof top decks in the Historic District Design Guidelines. The Design Guidelines state that decks in general should be sited discreetly in a rear yard to minimize their visibility from the street, inset at least 6 inches from the side elevations when possible and to align generally with the building's first floor level. Decks should be designed as contemporary elements and constructed to ensure minimal physical damage to the historic building. They should be located to avoid interference with or relocation of significant building features including exterior trim, projecting bays, porches, terraces, doors and windows and self-supporting so that connections to the house can be minimized and structural failures of the deck will not impact the historic structure.

Although there is a 2nd floor exterior door leading to the proposed location of the deck, there is no indication from aerial photographs that there was an outdoor space on the roof of the one-story wing in the location of the proposed roof top deck. The applicant's proposed roof top deck extends 10 feet beyond the two-story main block of the house and would be visible from Johnson Street. The deck being elevated 14-16 inches above the flat roof will also make the deck more visible from Johnson Street.

The roof top deck, as currently constructed, has not been designed to be self-supporting and has been tied into to the masonry walls of the home as well as its roof structure. The dark gray ribbed metal roof would have required a minor works COA at a minimum if done separately from the deck but is being considered as part of the combined scope of work associated with the proposed deck. The metal roofing located under the raised portion of the deck is installed over a rubber membrane roof, which was previously the roofing material used over the entire one-story flat-roofed wing of the house. Due to the location of the new metal roofing towards the rear corner of the house behind the screened porch and the extremely low pitch of the roof, this change in roof material is not visible and should not impact the historic character of the home. The pressure treated wood components of the deck as well as the proposed metal balusters, if they were used on a deck in a different location, would be considered compatible with the historic building in material, scale and proportion.

The following design guidelines for *Decks* are relevant to the applicant's request to construct a roof top deck:

1. *Site and construct decks so they do not detract from the overall historic character of the historic building, district, or landmark and so that the historic fabric of the district of landmark property and its character-defining features and details are not obscured or damaged.*

2. *Design decks to be structurally self-supporting to minimize their impact on the historic building and so they may be removed in the future without damage to the historic building.*
3. *Minimize the visibility of new residential decks from the street by locating them on non-character-defining elevations, typically the rear elevation, and inseting them from the corners of the historic building.*
4. *Design and detail decks and associated railings and steps to be deferential to and also compatible with the historic building in material, scale, and proportion.*
5. *Design decks to align generally with the historic building's first floor level.*
8. *Where it is appropriate to site a new deck in a location that is visible from the public right-of-way, it should be treated in a more formal architectural way, paying careful attention to the details and finishes, including painting or staining the railings, structural support elements, and steps in finishes compatible with the finishes of the historic building.*

The following design guidelines for *Roofs* are relevant to the applicant's request to construct a new metal roof, on top of which the deck is proposed to be built:

1. *Retain and preserve roofs and roof forms that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including their functional and decorative features, such as roofing materials, cresting, dormers, chimneys, cupolas, and cornices.*
8. *It is not appropriate to introduce new roof features such as skylights, dormers, or vents if they will compromise the historic roof design, or damage character-defining roof materials or the character of the historic district or landmark.*

Prior to approval of any Certificate of Appropriateness request, the Commission must make a finding that the applicant's proposed work is congruent with the special character of the Johnson Street Historic District and in compliance with the Historic District Design Guidelines. Issuance of a construction permit is also required prior to construction of any proposed deck.

Recommendation

Staff recommends denial of the requested Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a deck on the one-story wing located on the northwest corner of the house because the request is not congruent with the Johnson Street Historic District and the Historic District Design Guidelines based on the following:

- The location of the proposed roof top deck alters the historic building's character-defining front elevation by extending beyond the main body of the house, not being inset from the corners of the building, and being visible from Johnson Street;
- The height of the deck above the flat roof of the one-story wing located on the northwest corner of the house makes the deck more visible from Johnson Street; and
- The deck has not been designed to be self-supporting to minimize its impact on the historic building and will be difficult to remove in the future without damaging the historic structure.

Staff recommends approval of the low-profile dark gray metal ribbed roofing proposed for a portion of the flat roof covering the one-story wing located on the northwest corner of the residence because the request is congruent with the Johnson Street Historic District and the Historic District Guidelines based on the following:

- The location of the proposed metal roof is not visible from Johnson Street and does not impact the character-defining features of the J. Everett Marsh Jr. house;
- The extremely low pitch of the flat roof makes the use of a low-profile dark gray metal ribbed roof a good alternative to a rubber membrane or a tar and gravel roof; and
- The installation of the low-profile dark gray metal ribbed roof will not compromise the historic roof design, or damage character-defining roof materials or the character of the historic district.

Report Preparation

This report was prepared by Planning and Development Department staff member David J. Fencl, AICP and reviewed by Christopher Andrews, AICP and G. Lee Burnette, AICP.